

# HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION **DESIGN REVIEW COMMITTEE (D.R.C.) MEETING**

# **SYNOPSIS**

WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 15, 2008
12:00 -1:30 P.M.
City Hall Tower
200 East Santa Clara Street
ROOM T-222

## **COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

### DANA PEAK, and STEVEN COHEN

**Design Review Committee Meeting Goal:** Discuss project design conformance to applicable City of San Jose historic design guidelines, based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties

### Proposed projects for consideration:

1. Ryland Pool: (Candidate City Landmark) rehabilitation – The project includes restoration of the existing historic pool wall, including replacement of the ceramic tilework. The project site is located in Ryland Park, a 3.1-acre City park located between North 1<sup>st</sup> Street and North San Pedro Street. It is bounded on the south by a private street (Ryland Park Drive), and by a housing development to the north. A Historic Report was written in September 2007 as part of a public project that consisted of an addition of a wheelchair access ramp and a concrete platform to the exterior of the existing wading pool which has since been built. The historic report included information that the 1927 park and wading pool were designed by prominent local architect Charles S. McKenzie, and that the pool qualifies as a Candidate City Landmark. The project was presented to DRC in September 2007. The historic report and City of San Jose Historic Resources Inventory (HRI) designation were presented to the full Historic Landmarks Commission in October 2007. HLC recommended listing the pool as a Candidate City Landmark.

This project was brought before the DRC in September 2008 to present the findings written by the Architectural Conservator (Carey & Co) regarding the historic Batchelder tiles embedded in Ryland Pool. A hard copy of this report is attached.

The purpose of bringing the project back to the DRC is to present a response to comments made at the September DRC meeting. The synopsis of the September DRC meeting is attached for your review.

Tina Morrill of the CPAC for Ryland Pool presenting.

Primary conclusions reached by the subcommittee's discussion included:

- The revised replica of the pool Batchelder tiles looks a lot more like the original tile compared with the tile submitted at the September DRC meeting (Standard #6).
- It may be possible to further improve the tile. However, the replica should not look exactly like the original and should be differentiated (Standard #9).
- The color of the diamond shaped tile could better match the Batchelder tiles (Standard #6).
- Some original tiles should be displayed on the pool for educational purposes (Standard #6).
- 2. **CP08-058**: Conditional Use Permit to allow a remodel of the existing structure (including replacement of the existing windows, the installation of a new led strip and the addition of new foam trim above windows), an addition to the existing primary structure, replacement and refurbishing of on site hardscape and landscaping and operation of a public eating/drinking establishment, a bar and after midnight operation until 2:00 am on a 0.22-gross acre site. The site is listed as a structure/site that is Eligible for the National and California Registers and as a Structure of Merit (DPR attached) and is adjacent to the following historic resources:
  - Garden City Modern Bakery 87-97 San Pedro Street Eligible for the National Register and for the California Register and is a Structure of Merit (DPR attached).
  - Coronado Livery Stables 55-71 San Pedro Street Structure of Merit (DPR attached).
  - Luis Maria Peralta Adobe 184 St. John Street, APN 259-35-050 National Register Site,
     State Landmark and City Landmark Structure (DPR and documentation attached).

All of the above sites are within the San Pedro Square which was identified as an historic district within the Downtown Strategy Plan. San Pedro Square was part of the Downtown San Jose Historic Resources Survey. Attached is an analysis of San Pedro Square taken from this Survey document.

Ella Samonsky, Project Manager

Primary issues of concern in the subcommittee's discussion included:

After the applicant indicated that the proposal has been revised since the packet submittal, and clarified that no changes are being proposed to the front elevation, the following issues were raised:

- The building should remain in its original form to the extent possible. The existing brick wall adds ambiance to the adjacent space. If the doors proposed along this side elevation have a useful function, connecting the building to the outdoor seating area, they should remain. The doors proposed along the side elevation and in the new addition should be differentiated from the existing building. The doors should not have the divided lights, be simpler in style and have amore industrial look (Standard #9).
- The new addition should not include arch elements. All windows should remain rectangular (Standard #9).
- Any replacement windows proposed should be compatible with windows of buildings in the area. The applicant clarified that the front façade would not include any new openings or replacement windows and that the existing windows would remain.
- 3. PD08-017: Planned Development Permit to allow an approximately 4711 sq. ft. for mausoleum use on a 165.3 gross acre site. The Mausoleum is proposed in the southwest quadrant of the Oak Hill Cemetery memorial park which is listed as a site that is Eligible for the National Register (see attached DPR). The mausoleum is proposed to be set into the hillside on the south side of

Hillside Drive and west of an existing contemporary mausoleum structure. A detailed description of the project is attached for your review.

A Planned Development Zoning File No. PDC01-048 for a master plan of the park was approved in June 2002. A Negative Declaration was circulated at the Zoning stage and identified historic resources as a primary environmental issue<sup>1</sup>. The city therefore required that the new structure conform to the Secretary of Interior Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties. The Zoning Development Standards required that the final design and location shall be subject to review and recommendation by the Historic Landmarks Commission. A historic analysis was submitted to Planning determining that the proposed project is in conformance with the Secretary of Interior Standards. This analysis is attached for your review and consideration.

Chris Burton, Project Manager

Primary issues of concern in the subcommittee's discussion included:

- Building the structure into the hill reduces the impact of the project.
- A chronology of the site would be useful with a map showing the buildings on the site, when they were constructed highlighting the most significant structures.
- The Standards Analysis should be revised to include the following changes/additions:
  - Include more quantitative language regarding the height of the building. A three dimensional rendering would be useful.
  - The third sentence in the paragraph on Page 11 under New Additions-Locations should be revised to make sense.
  - An explanation of how the project conforms to the Secretary of Interior Standards should be added.
  - The map in the report should include dates of existing buildings

JOSEPH HORWEDEL, AICP, DIRECTOR
DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING, BUILDING AND CODE ENFORCEMENT

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> A historic report of the Oak Hill Cemetery Memorial Park was completed as part of this zoning. If you are interested in a copy of this report please contact Hadasa Lev at (408) 535 7838.